

threat to comital-royal power. Additional threats to Alfons and Pere's comital-royal authority came from the county of Urgell, because of Lleida's proximity to established communities in Aragon and Catalonia.

The monograph culminates with part 3 and a look at the thirteenth-century repercussions. The laws that Roman Berenguer IV imposed in Tortosa and Lleida back in the twelfth century left ambiguous the question of their jurisdictional rights. It also set precedents for newly won land in Valencia to follow the customs of Lleida. The confusion and ambiguity led to endless regrouping of land and constant tension between the Crown of Aragon and the principate of Barcelona. However, such ambiguity and redistributing of land also created an environment that allowed for the stripping of jurisdictional autonomy of lords and solidifying of royal authority. In fact, the Aragonese monarchy asserted rights in the thirteenth century that had been established in the twelfth, and Tortosa developed into a royal center. An increase in royal control and presence of royal officials in cities replaced more attentive local lords and resulted in an increased growth of "municipal organizations ... as they expanded to fill the administrative vacuum within the city" (276). Barton shows that the ways in which the frontier was conquered had a direct effect on "postconquest societal development," which was now taking place outside of a frontier environment (9). Barton ends the monograph concisely with, "After a cycle of conquest, royal administrative retreat, and seigniorial consolidation, the Crown increasingly found itself invested with the means to emerge from the shadow of victory and begin to realize, albeit gradually and inconsistently, the governmental ambitions of the eleventh- and twelfth-century counts and count-kings" (292).

In addition to the overarching themes of territorial expansion, consolidation, and frontier administration, the text is replete with anecdotes that only come with hawkeyed investigation of archival documents. For example, the bizarre 1180 case in which the Muslim *aljama* of Tortosa accused the local bailiffs of running a "scam in which they allegedly forced marrying Muslim couples to hire wedding singers who were in the officers' employ" (157). Though not the main focus of this study, the importance and power of the military orders and elite women (Sancha, Elvira, Aurembaix, etc.) is revealed throughout the text, opening an avenue for future studies.

While Barton makes an effort in keeping clear the many counts, kings, lords, queens, and ladies (see diagrams in appendix) the complex prosopography can be dizzying for a nonexpert. His overuse of the demonstrative pronoun "this/those" adds to the confusion. A short review cannot do justice to the complicated and meticulous feat that Barton has achieved. While this text may not be appropriate as an entry into the study of medieval Catalonia and Aragon, it is a welcome and necessary addition to the corpus of Iberian studies.

HANNAH MARYAN THOMSON, Art History, University of California,
Los Angeles

Alison I. Beach and Isabelle Cochelin, eds., *The Cambridge History of Medieval Monasticism in the Latin West*, vol. 2, *The High and Late Middle Ages* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 2020) xi + 568 pp.

In *Medieval Monasticism in the Latin West: The High and Late Middle Ages*, editors Alison I. Beach and Isabelle Cochelin usher an ambitious project to a

successful conclusion. Beach and Cochelin deliberately posit their project as collaborative and open-ended, disrupting established narratives and posing new challenges for future researchers rather than constructing a new comprehensive history. However, the editors and expert contributors to the volume have nevertheless created an impressive framework for such a new history. The series will doubtless be a useful support for students, as well as a stable starting place for advanced researchers hoping to add even more depth and color to the narratives sketched here.

Volume 2 is divided into two sections, parts 3 and 4 which discuss, respectively, the long twelfth century and the thirteenth century through the end of the Middle Ages (generally corresponding to the reformations of the sixteenth century and subsequent major changes to monastic life). Each section begins with a historiographical survey of major research, followed by an article introducing significant sources and types of evidence. These four essays transcend the merely introductory, engaging substantively with the contributions that follow, though each has a slightly different focus. John Van Engen's "Historiographical Approaches to Monasticism in the Long Twelfth Century" (chapter 34) for instance, highlights the late medieval and early modern perspectives from which contemporary scholarly narratives emerged, while Elisabeth Lusset and Bert Roest's introduction to part 4, "Late Medieval Monasticism: Historiography and Prospects" (chapter 50) suggests directions for the future of the field. Lauren Mancia's "Sources for Monasticism in the Long Twelfth Century" (chapter 35) is an excellent resource for students in particular. Mancia is equally straightforward and sophisticated in describing varieties of documentary evidence, common pitfalls or challenges, and the interaction of documentary and narrative sources such as hagiographies and chronicles.

Volume 2 shares the goals established in volume 1: to rebalance the study of monasticism from an overreliance on order-history, to fully integrate women into the history of monasticism rather than relegating them to the margins, to incorporate noncenobitic monasticism, and, above all, to proceed from a position of medieval monastic self-definition. Rather than producing a monolithic new narrative, Beach and Cochelin have gathered a "team" of experts to "stimulate new directions for research" with contributions from a wide range of perspectives (15). Nevertheless, distinct themes do emerge in each section. Part 1 frequently describes early monasticism using the language of the "laboratory" or "experiment," the practices and patterns of which were regularized and consolidated during the Carolingian period described in part 2. Volume 2, *The High and Late Middle Ages*, begins from this vantage point. Part 3 considers the institutionalization of monastic orders over the course of the "long twelfth century," considering aspects of internal organization as well their deep connections to and profound impact on the world outside the cloister.

Some articles, such as chapter 47, "The Medical Role of Monasteries" by Elma Brenner, weave recent research into a summarizing approach. Brenner summarizes the medical aspects of standard monastic sources such as the *Regula Benedicti*, describes the role of medicine within different orders, including the mendicant orders, and considers the role of monasteries as medical centers in lay society, through their establishment of hospitals and leprosaria, paying particular

attention to the significance of lay status, gender, and age within these institutions.

Other contributions have a narrower focus. Chapter 43, "Gender and Monastic Liturgy in the Latin West (High and Late Middle Ages)" by Gisela Muschiol and translated by Beach, shows how the volume consistently foregrounds gender. Muschiol considers the development of the Mass and the liturgy of the hours in the later Middle Ages, using both textual and material sources. She shows that "gender difference in the context of liturgy is not merely a modern academic interest: the postures, gestures, texts and material culture associated with the liturgy within medieval monastic communities reflect a deep contemporary concern with gender" (814). This is echoed in Chapter 39 by Fiona J. Griffiths, "The Mass in Monastic Practice: Nuns and Ordained Monks, c. 400–1200)," which considers the "problems and possibilities" engendered by the increased significance of the Mass within monastic communities in the later Middle Ages (734). This forged new symbiotic relationships between men and women in the monastic sphere, even as it also introduced more forceful gender divisions into monastic communities and diluted monastic women's authority within their own spheres. Both articles also connect to chapter 52 in part 4, "Monastic Liturgy, 1100–1500: Continuity and Performance," in which Susan Boynton considers the substrate of the liturgy as integral to the identity of monastic communities.

Part 4 considers the diversification of monasticism in the later Middle Ages. The contributions in this section grapple with changing norms within established monastic orders, as well as with the rise of newer forms of monasticism, including lay monastic identities. The articles in part 4 are invested in overturning older scholarly narratives of dysfunction and decline in the "quality" of monasticism (928). They advocate instead that later medieval monastic life should not be judged according to static norms derived from earlier centuries, but by its contributions to the dynamic needs of later medieval society. Chapter 53, "Books and Libraries within Monasteries" by Eva Schlotheuber and John T. McQuillen, with translation by Eliza Jaeger, exemplifies this approach. The article considers practical aspects and general norms of book production, storage, and use in later medieval monasteries, and traces the evolution of these norms through several case studies. The article also counters popular assumptions about medieval monasteries as sealed-off hoarders of books and knowledge, pointing to fifteenth-century German monks' employment of commercial scribes to produce texts aiding monastic liturgical and educational reforms (994). Rather than the advent of print being a death knell to monastic book production, the authors show that early printers, including Gutenberg, "focused on the monastic market and produced texts that they knew would sell to this pan-European group" (995). Such details do much to counter prevailing narratives about intellectual decline in later monasteries. Chapter 58 by James G. Clark, "Monks and the Universities, c. 1200–1500," similarly seeks to dismantle a prevailing narrative of conflict between monks and another distinctively later medieval institution, the university. Monks did not only passively and antagonistically react to the growth of universities, "rather they were active in their evolution, shaping their learned culture with a mature syllabus of their own" (1074).

A trio of articles on lay and female monasticism by Megan Cassidy Welch, Cristina Andenna, and Alison More and Anneke Mulder-Bakker also deserves mention. Chapters 55, 56, and 57 together sketch a cohesive narrative: the role of lay brothers and sisters in monastic communities diminished, while diverse alternatives for lives that combined action and contemplation became abundant. Options for women included becoming a beguine, tertiary, recluse, or living an unclassified devout life in a private household. These women, often following the apostolic example of Mary Magdalen, were creative and resourceful in their attempts to skirt legislative prohibitions, though More and Mulder-Bakker also show how spiritual and material support from individual bishops and papal legates, as well as from secular rulers such as the countesses of Flanders, allowed “lay-monastic” women to flourish despite increasingly restrictive laws (1065–1066).

Finally, chapter 62, Sigrid Hirbodian’s article on “Research on Monasticism in the German Tradition” (translated by Beach), illustrates the potential of the “quintessentially German” *Landesgeschichte*, or “regional history,” to deepen contemporary international research (1140). Like Hedwig Röckelein’s article on “Monastic Landscapes” in part 3 (chapter 44), which introduces readers to “thick description,” network analysis, and GIS-based cartography, Hirbodian’s article provides a welcome foray into methodology that may help students and scholars materially advance their own work.

The volume’s impressive scope, and formidable level of detail outweigh any minor shortcomings. The organization of the volume thematically within loose temporal boundaries liberates it from a teleological master narrative but does lead to occasional repetition—several articles in part 4, for example, begin around 1100, repeating discussions from part 3. As acknowledged in the introduction, those in search of a more direct chronology, a history of individual orders, or a succinct description of major events such as the Observant reforms or the rise of the mendicant orders must look elsewhere. Certain intriguing themes suggested by the introductory essays are not taken up in the contributions that follow, such as the role of gesture and orality in later medieval monastic communication (945). Not every study is as “focused and detailed” as promised in the introduction, and some seem content only to summarize and dismiss old arguments (21).

Overall however, this volume powerfully and effectively reorients the study of high and late medieval monasticism toward its own complex and dynamic context. These contributions provide a sturdy framework upon which the next generation of scholars can confidently build.

LYDIA SHAHAN, Committee on the Study of Religion, Harvard University

Barbara Bombi, *Anglo-Papal Relations in the Early Fourteenth Century: A Study in Medieval Diplomacy* (Oxford: Oxford University Press 2019) xii + 273 pp.

Barbara Bombi’s monograph is a study of the modalities of diplomatic communication between the English and the papal courts in the context of the prelude and beginning of the Hundred Years War (1305–1360). The book, a welcome contribution in the field of medieval diplomacy, adopts the angle of Anglo-papal history on one of the most infamous sequence of Anglo-French